

Paul Kretschmer and Hansjorg Frommer About the language and Education of the Illyrians

Fatmire Vrapi (Corresponding Author)
"Aleksander Xhuvani" University of Elbasan, Albania

Asllan Vrapi
"Ismail Qemali" University of Vlora, Albania
Email: asllan.vrapi@univlora.edu.al

Article History

Received: 19 January, 2024


Revised: 3 March, 2024

Accepted: 30 March, 2024

Published: 4 April, 2024

Copyright © 2024 ARPG & Author

This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution International

 CC BY: Creative Commons Attribution License 4.0

Abstract

The European Renaissance brought important developments in science and at the same time in the studies of the language, history and culture of nations. Due to the Ottoman occupation and the geographical position, the language and history of the Albanians for a long time were unknown to German and European scholars in general. For these reasons, the first studies of Europeans focused on the study of Albanians as a separate entity within the empire. Albanians, being part of a region through which empires spread, conquered, strengthened, fought each other, promiscuous, weakened and replaced each other, had been part of the contributions to those developments. Albanians had lost part of their identity and gained at the same time, managing to preserve some distinctive features of the nationality such as language and historical and cultural heritage. An important contribution to the language, history and culture of the Albanians was made by German researchers. German albanologists have made a special contribution to albanology, language, history and culture of Albanians. Among German albanologists, Paul Kretschmer and Hansjorg Frommer are studied. Mainly their studies focus on archaeological finds, old writings, works of ancestors, oral heritage and linguistic, cultural and historical specifics.

Keywords: German albanologists; Phonetic forms; Albanian language; Comparative linguistics; European renaissance; Mythological universe.

1. Introduction

The life and work of Paul **Kretschmer** and Hansjorg Frommer.

Born on May 2, 1866

Berlin, Prussia

Died March 9, 1956 (age 89)

Vienna, Austria

German nationality

Academic work: Studied Indo-European linguistics.

Paul Kretschmer

Paul Kretschmer was a German linguist who studied the earliest history and relationships of the Indo-European languages and showed how they were influenced by non-Indo-European languages, such as Etruscan.

Kretschmer studied classical and Indo-European philology. His epoch-making study of pre-Greek elements in ancient Greek was the 1896 Introduction to the History of the Greek Language. (Einleitung in die Geschichte der griechischen Sprache).

Hansjorg Frommer

The Illyrians (Written by Hansjorg Frommer)

Hansjörg Frommer (born 3 April 1939 in Saulgau) is a doctor of history who works in Karlsruhe as a lecturer at the Academy for Continuing Scientific Education, Karlsruhe (AWWK). Frommer received his doctorate in 1968 in Tübingen on "The Ideal of the French Monarchy in Montesquieu (Montesquieu)".

According to Wikipedia: "Dr. Frommer has been a lecturer at Volkshochschule Karlsruhe for many years and was its pedagogical director until 2003. Most of his books were published by Info-Verlag in Karlsruhe. In 2013, Dr. Hansjörg Frommer was awarded the "Culture for International Understanding" Award.

1.1. The Research Questions

What is the contribution of the German albanologists Paul **Kretschmer** and Hansjörg Frömmer to the language, history and culture of the Albanians?

1.2. Theoretical basis

Paul Kretschmer comparing Greek names with their foreign counterparts in ancient Anatolia, concluded that a non-Greek, Mediterranean culture had preceded the Greeks there, leaving linguistic traces. Discoveries by archaeologist Sir Arthur Evans at Knossos, Crete, around 1900 tended to confirm Kretschmer's views. British archaeologist Sir Arthur excavated the ruins of the ancient city of Knossos in Crete and discovered evidence of a sophisticated Bronze Age civilization, which he called Minoan. His work was one of the major achievements of archaeology and greatly advanced the study of European and eastern Mediterranean prehistory" (The Editors of Encyclopaedia Britannica www.britannica.com/biography/Arthur-Evans).

At the University of Marburg in Germany (1897–99), Kretschmer held the chair in comparative linguistics at the University of Vienna, where he remained until 1936. A member of the Neogrammarian linguistic school, which emphasized rigorous comparative methodology, he also contributed to Greek dialectology modern and continued the study of German linguistic geography.

Paul Kretschmer was a professor at the University of Marburg of comparative linguistics, then at the University of Vienna. In 1896 he published the work "Einleitung in die Geschichte der griechischen Sprache" ("Introduction to the History of the Greek Language"). In this pioneering work, this scholar devotes over 40 pages to the Illyrians and their role in early times.

Kretschmer talks about the symbiosis in the mythological universe between the Illyrians and the Greeks. He writes: "So if the view expressed above is confirmed, that the Illyrian tribes and the northwestern Greek tribes were mixed, the linguistic distance between them was not as great as later; yet even then between the two tribal groups there existed an apparent national contradiction, or it was at that period that hostile contacts were established: and of these contradictions we are aware. Epirus is the place where the name of the Greeks was born" (Zeqo, 2018) In these lines, the researcher Maikom Zeqo, referring to the doubt whether the thesis of the mixing of the Illyrian tribes with the northwestern Greek tribes is true, emphasizes that the linguistic distance between them does not it has been great. For this, he brings the fact of the need for mutual communication. As for the name, I think that in most cases the names of tribes or toponyms are names of other tribes to identify the difference between the other tribe and their tribe. With this, I want to clarify the statement that Epirus was the place where the emir of the Greeks was born. Why? Because Epirus was a territory according to Kretschmer with a mixed population. Referring to Kretschmer's publication on the linguistic prehistory of the Balkans in an edition of the Renaissance in Pristina prepared by the researcher and translator Nelson Çabej, we are familiar with the settlement of the tribes in the vast area of the Balkan region: "After the Hellenes also flocked from the north two other Indo-Germanic tribes, in the east the Thracians and in the west the Illyrians who filled the vast space of the Balkan region" (Chabey, 1990).

Referring to the publication of the scholar Zeqo about the publications of Kretschmer always, if they are true we manage to create an even clearer idea about the Illyrian population and the language it used in Epirus. Publications about the language used by the Illyrian tribes can also be found in an American magazine The American Journal of Archeology and of the History of the Fine Arts earlier referring to the discoveries at Kretschmer we read: "Kretschmer gives a table including results from forty-two vases of the red-figure style, to illustrate this feature. From this table, it appears that certain Ionic letters spread before others. Except: I, -, and Y, were created first, and in no vase bearing Ionic letters do the Attic(e) notes X, IM" (1894. 375)

Referring to the form of writing in old ceramic works according to the aforementioned magazine, Kretschmer defends that there was an ancient culture of writing. Even debating the quality of the drawings, he points out that at first sight, it appears that: "these men generally spoke (communicated) and that the peculiarities in the exhibited speech can be accepted as popular speech, although they are attributed to ignorance, errors and works careless in pottery"(1894. 376). At the same time, he emphasizes that these drawings, when repeated time and time again and with a beautiful appearance, show that they are not random but show an admirable culture for the time: "when the same distinctive forms are repeated, this reason is not enough, it is met especially in cases where the writing is done with great beauty, and thus forms a part of the ornament of the vase, as they are also occasionally found in epitaphs, and the warning that hypercriticism is as unscientific as absence is as fruitful as it" (The American Journal of Archeology and of the History of the Fine Arts Vol. 9, No. 3 (Jul. - Sep., 1894. 376).

I think that we should not confuse the emigration of the Illyrian tribes many centuries BC with the Albanian emigration after the death of Skenderbeu where according to the researcher Çabej: "The immigration happened sometime between the third and second millennium BC"(Chabey, 1990).

The migration of the Illyrian tribes, or at least one of them, is also supported by the work of the researcher Nelson Çabej: "That the Illyrians or a part of them went to their southern lands later than the Thracians, this must be accepted because the Illyrians have been superimposed on them in some places the Thracians and they were left with the land in the west of the Balkans up to the Adriatic" (Chabey, 1990).

According to Paul Kretschmer: "The Illyrians needed to call the foreign nation that had crossed their path with a general name and gave it the name of one of its tribes, the Greeks" (Zeqo, 2015) Mw tej, the researcher continues: "This name was taken with them by the Illyrian-Epirote tribes who, through the sea, migrated to Italy, and in this way it was taken to the west where this name still prevails today, which was taken there long before the name "Ελληνες gained value general even among the Greeks themselves" (Zeqo, 2015). From Kretschmer's publications,

we notice that the designation: "Greek", "Greek" did not exist before but is a designation established by the Illyrian tribes in Epirus for other tribes different from those in the spoken language.

Another very important moment where Kretschmer stops is the clarification of the connection between the phonetic form Odysseus and the Latin phonetic form Ulysses. "These same tribes have also brought to the Italian peoples the figure of the Odysseus saga; for the phonetic form of the Latin Ulixes, Olixes clearly shows that the Romans first knew the Odyssey, not through the Ionian epic. The Mesapeake language had a spirant that was represented by the Romans sometimes with x, sometimes with s, by the Greeks with ζ and σ, while in the Mesapeake writings itself it is given with I and before t with X or Σ: the singular gender of Dazet (with Δαζιμος, Δαζουπος, Dases, Dassius, etc. with close roots), will sometimes be written ΔΑΧΤΑΣ, sometimes ΔΑΣΤΑΣ" Kretschmer, P., according to Zeqo (2015). According to researcher Zeqo, in order to clarify the change in the form of writing and the letters used by Odysseus in Ulysses, Kretschmer refers to the Venetic alphabet as follows: "The Venetic alphabet has a special sign for this sound, which is also found in Celtic inscriptions and in the Latin script it is expressed by x, xx, xs, c, ss, s. Pauli (Veneter, p. 154 ff) has spoken in great detail about these relationships and has given this irrational sound the value of a š" (Zeqo).

Other researchers, referring to the works of Paul Kretschmer, point out how the written and phonetic form of the word Odysseus changed on the Balkan coast, taking the form of Ulysses on the Italian coast: "Even Ulixes speaks of a non-epic source. Now we know from the inscriptions that the Athenians, Boeotians, and Corinthians called the hero 'Olyssεύς or 'Oλυρτεύς and not 'Oδυσσεύς... According to Quintil I 4, 16, even Aeolian must have been Olisseus" (Jordan). The well-known Albanian researcher M. Zeqo, referring to Kretschmer's works on the transformation of δ to λ, states: "Now it is possible that the phonetic transformation from δ to λ can be attributed to the Illyrian-Epirote tribes... The name of Odysseus-Ulysses had to be brought here only as valid evidence of the mediating role played by the Illyrian emigrants between the Balkan and Apennine regions" (Zeqo, 2018).

Paul Kretschmer thus makes an innovative analysis with a major monument of the ancient world such as Homer's epic.

The thesis that the form of Ulysses was transmitted to the peoples of Western Europe through the Illyrians shows that the Illyrians knew the Homeric epic as an oral culture, although not in written form. Odysseus pronounced as Ulysses was recognized according to the phonetic, morphological modeling of the Illyrians. James Joyce's work was called "Ulysses", not "Odysseus". This means that the Illyrians (Mesapians, Japigs) across the Ionian and Adriatic seas passed on to other peoples their Ulysses form and perhaps in competition with the Odysseus form, a competition, or parallel, that may have continued for centuries. The European West finally sanctioned the Illyrian form Ulysses until today. This is a first-class cultural act where the Illyrians are presented as the initiators and negotiators of one of the most famous and memorable names of world civilization. This phenomenon is worth studying further. This is also related to other Homeric monument names, thus galvanizing the anthroponymic terminology of the names of Mediterranean heroes and deities in Europe.

Kretschmer believes that the cult of Ulysses (Odysseus) itself was fermented in the Illyrian Epirot environment. Not only as a mindset and cultic practice but also as a linguistic substance.

Paul Kretschmer, according to the researcher Maikom Zeqo, mentioning the emigration of the Illyrian tribes, underlines: These tribes, whose need or desire for conquest pushed them to attack from their northern lands towards the south, even in the provinces west of Pindi and Oeta, did not find space enough. Their further extension towards the East was impeded not only by the wild and impassable and trackless ranges but still more by the dense population of the provinces there, into which the Greek tribes, who had already moved from the west, the Thessalians, the Boeotians, the hands" (Zeqo).

Taking into account that the Illyrian tribes encountered an obstacle to extending to the south, we can understand that these tribes did not manage to move far to the south, as the researcher M. Zeqo, referring to the publication of Paul Kretschmer, states: "This is how it changed direction the stream of Illyrian emigrants from the west through the sea towards the opposite Italian coast. These phenomena were by no means unknown to Roman authors. These data were confirmed by two facts: first, by the matching of the names of tribes and places on both sides of the Adriatic Sea" (Zeqo).

It should be emphasized that the Illyrian tribes had their development and culture, even an early form of writing, as evidenced by the writings found in the south of Italy: "Another and powerful argument for the migration of the Illyrian tribes to the Italic region is provided by the inscriptions of Calabria, written in a non-Greek and non-similar language that was undoubtedly known to the Mesapeakes who lived there. In this way, we come to the problem that interested us in the first place in the matter of the language of the Illyrians and the people close to them" (Zeqo). As long as these early writings are found used by the Illyrian tribes that migrated to Southern Italy, we can think that the writing also existed in the areas of origin of their migration to the Illyrian tribes in Epirus, but the long period and continuous invasions have had a negative impact in their existence.

Kretschmer thus provides a scientific picture, where it is proven that the Illyrians of their peninsula and the Illyrians of the Apennine peninsula, especially in Southern Italy (the Mesapes, the Japigs) had sanctioned their names, the names of the cities, the geographical names. So the Adriatic Sea was, in a way, the Illyrian Sea.

The nomadic but also colonizing Illyrian phenomenon on the Italic coast is extremely important, but rarely seriously studied.

In the publication "Autochthony of Albanians in German Studies" prepared by the researcher Nelson Çabej and published by the Rilindja publishing house in Pristina, the weakening of the Illyrians after the attacks of the Slavs is mentioned: "The division of Illyria into three as it was done after the victory of the Romans over King Ghent, was

also reflected in the division of the provinces...Northern Illyria, which was Romanized last, was Romanized by Italy and when the empire was divided, it became part of the Western Empire" (Chabey, 1990).

while South Illyria continued to be under the possession of Byzantium, who according to Hansjörg Frömmer, the Byzantines "found that "Arbanoni", the Albanian linguistic community was located in the hinterland of Durrës" while Shstat Myler sees this territorial core in the territory of the Mat River" (Chabey, 1990). Also, in his publication, Frommer talks about the suppression of the Illyrian population and its displacement towards the south. In the book "The Illyrians" by Hansjörg Frömmer, information is given on the displacement of the Illyrian population as a result of the barbaric attacks of the Slavs from the north. For this "from the end of the 6th century and the beginning of the 7th century, it is thought that a migration of the Illyrians from Dalmatia to today's Albania took place, although such a migration is not described in the history books, but a clear evidence of this is the Albanian language " (Chabey, 1990). Further, the author dwells on the influences on the Albanian language of the Roman occupation in North Illyria and the Byzantine one in South Illyria, clarifying his assumption on the evidence of the Albanian language. Frommer states that "a golden evidence for this is a layer of ancient Latin words of everyday use. These words belong to the II and III centuries, while the influence of Greek on Albanian is later and weaker" (Chabey, 1990).

The influx of Illyrians as a result of the attacks of the Slavs caused them to greatly reduce their territory and, on the other hand, to preserve their identity.

2. Study Findings

From the study on the contribution of the German albanologists Paul Kretschmer and Hansjörg Frömmer to the language, history and culture of the Albanians, we single out the following findings:

1. Epirus was a territory with a mixed population.
2. Epirus was the place where the name of the Greeks was born because Epirus was a territory according to Kretschmer with a mixed Illyrian population and population alienated from Thrace.
3. The linguistic distance between the Illyrians and the Greeks was not as great as later.
4. Already in the third and second millennium between the two tribal groups, the Illyrians and the Greeks, there was an obvious national contradiction, or it was precisely in that period that hostile contacts were established.
5. Another very important moment where Kretschmer stops is the clarification of the connection between the phonetic form Odysseus and the Latin phonetic form Ulysses.
6. Kretschmer believes that the cult of Ulysses (Odysseus) itself was fermented in the Illyrian Epirote environment. Not only as a mindset and cultic practice but also as a linguistic substance.
7. The Illyrian tribes have their development and culture and even an early form of writing for this is evidenced by the writings found in southern Italy used by the Illyrian tribes that migrated to southern Italy.
8. We can think that writing also existed in the areas of origin of their migration to the Illyrian tribes in the Balkans.
9. Many of Paul Kretschmer conclusions and findings may have been influenced by Greek history and archaeology because although he emphasizes that pre-Greek writings were found in Epirus, which means that other peoples lived in these territories before the present-day Greeks, he fails to emphasize that other native populations lived in those territories.
10. According to Hansjörg Frömmer, the Byzantines "found that "Arbanoni", the Albanian linguistic community was located in the hinterland of Durres.
11. In his publication, Fromer talks about the suppression of the Illyrian population and its displacement towards the south. In the book "The Illyrians" by Hansjörg Frömmer, information is given on the displacement of the Illyrian population as a result of the barbaric attacks of the Slavs from the north.
12. Fromer dwells on the influences on the Albanian language of the Roman occupation in North Illyria and the Byzantine occupation in South Illyria, clarifying the evidence on the Albanian language.
13. According to Fromer, the shrinking of the Illyrians as a result of the attacks of the Slavs caused them to reduce their territory a lot, but on the other hand, they were able to preserve their identity.

3. Conclusions

From the study of materials from various publications by the authors Paul Kreçmer and Hansjörg Frömmer and from the references that other researchers have made to these researchers as well as from the sources found on the Internet, we come to the following conclusions:

1. The publications presented by researchers Paul Kreçmer and Hansjörg Frömmer are important to create a clearer vision of where they were located, how they were organized, and the language used by the Illyrian tribes.
2. The Illyrian tribes have used a separate language from the other tribes, but they have all been able to communicate in areas with mixed populations, such as in Epirus, but they have also conflicted on the basis of linguistic differences.
3. Evidence of the language used by the Illyrians can be found especially in the Illyrian tribes that emigrated to Southern Italy, writings which do not belong to either the Illyrian or the Greek populations.
4. In many cases the authors, especially Hansjörg Frömmer, use today's names for empires and peoples incorrectly, for example, the name Greece is used instead of the Byzantine Empire, the Greek name is used for the peoples that made up the Byzantine Empire when it is known that it consisted of many peoples in different languages. Likewise, the name Italy is used instead of the Roman Empire.

5. It is noted that especially as a result of the Slavic attacks, Illyria shrunk a lot but still managed to preserve its linguistic and cultural identity.

6. In the Albanian language there is an ancient layer of Latin words of daily use. These words belong to the II and III centuries, while the influence of Greek on Albanian is later and weaker.

References

Chabey, N. (1990). *Autochthony of albanians in German studies*. Rilindja. Pristina.

Jordan Crit. Beitr. zur Gesch. d. lat. Spr.: 39.

Zeço Symbiosis between Illyrians and Greeks. Available: www.gazetadita.al/studime-per-iliret

Zeço (2015). Saga of Ulysses – Odysseus and Illyrians. Available: <https://at001.wordpress.com/2015/12/02/saga-of-ulysses-odysseus-and-illyrians/>

Zeço (2018). Available: <https://www.shqiperia.com/blog/paul-krecmer-1866-1956-universi-mitologjia-midis-ilireve-dhe-grekeve/>